

Chapter 3

General Approach

Consultants' Proposals

3.1 For the purpose of comparing jobs between the civil service and the private sector, Hay propose to use a method of job evaluation, devised by themselves, which has been used extensively during similar studies in various countries. This method involves selecting a representative sample of jobs in the civil service and comparing it with a similarly representative sample of jobs in the private sector. The content of these jobs will be investigated and evaluated to establish a basis for comparison. Since it is recognised that many civil service jobs do not have 'analogues' in the private sector, Hay do not propose to resort to direct job-matching between the civil service and private sector, but will adopt their own job evaluation method. This is a systematic process for measuring jobs on a factor basis, thereby facilitating the comparison of jobs of a completely different nature.

Views Expressed at PLSAC Meetings

(a) Association of Expatriate Civil Servants

The Pay Level Survey methodology should be readily understood by all staff. A small sample of direct job comparisons should be made as a cross-checking device.

(b) Hong Kong Institute of Personnel Management

Hay's proposed methodology is a sophisticated one and has been well tried out in other parts of the world. This should inspire confidence in their work.

(c) Police Force Council*

The current broadbanded structure of the disciplined services should be reviewed, taking into account the unique, dangerous and complicated

* In this Report, Police Force Council refers to the Staff Side of the Council only.

nature of the work of the Police Force. The only fair way of arriving at a correct level of police pay is by evaluating the relevant factors and special features in their own right without broadbanding the police with the remainder of the disciplined services.

(d) Senior Non-Expatriate Officers' Association

Has reservations about Hay's method of job comparison, which is likened to comparing apples with oranges, rather than apples with apples. This view is also shared by the Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association.

(e) Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association

(i) Doubts whether the Hay Guide Chart - Profile Method can evaluate accurately pay levels of civil service jobs since the method does not select identical jobs from the private sector and compare like with like.

(ii) The list of civil service jobs selected for pay comparison may not be representative of the civil service as a whole, since, out of a total of 992 non-Directorate ranks in the civil service, only 13% of the total and 9% of those on the Master Pay Scale are selected for pay comparison, despite the fact that there is a wide variety of duties and job types on the Master Pay Scale. Jobs in the educational, transport, marine, air traffic, trade, telecommunications, labour relations, inland revenue and data processing grades have all been ignored.

The Senior Civil Service Council and the Model Scale 1 Staff Consultative Council have also put forward their suggestions on the list of selected jobs.

(f) The Administration

Supports the methodology proposed by Hay, as do some other PLSAC members.

Chapter 4

Data Collection

Consultants' Proposals

For the Civil Service

4.1 Since the time and resources available do not permit all grades and ranks in the civil service to be examined, Hay will select for detailed examination a sample of jobs which is reasonably representative of the civil service as a whole. The criteria for the selection of jobs are in paragraph 2.7 of Annex C.

4.2 Hay stress the point that the sample selected will be of jobs, not employees, as the same job may be held by a large number of employees doing similar work and holding the same job title. However, the sample will be taken in such a way as to provide adequate coverage of the three civil service pay scales, i.e. the Master Pay Scale, Model Scale 1 and Disciplined Services Pay Scales. In accordance with the broadbanding approach, Hay, in their findings, will set out the relationship of civil service pay in each pay band to pay in the same pay band in the private sector, and particular grades or ranks will not be discussed individually. It is therefore not necessary to take a representative sample of each grade or even each pay scale, but only of the civil service as a whole.

4.3 Hay anticipate that about 140 civil service ranks will be selected and about 400 people interviewed. A complete list of the jobs selected by Hay is given in Appendix A of Annex C.

4.4 The collection of job data will be conducted in two stages. The first stage involves issuing all selected job holders with job description questionnaires. There will be two types of job description questionnaire : one for staff on Model Scale 1, Disciplined Services Pay Scale (Rank and File) and Master Pay Scale positions up to and including pay point 19 and another for staff on the Disciplined Services Pay Scale (Officers) and pay points 20 and above of the Master Pay Scale. Where doubt exists as to which questionnaire should be used, both will be provided.

4.5 The second stage entails the assembling together of all selected job holders in one grade for an interview, conducted by a trained consultant, whose task will be to gather further information on the range of activities covered by each job holder. These interviews will also serve to verify the information given in the questionnaires. Wherever necessary, additional information on job content will be sought from departmental heads, who may, if they wish, involve appropriate staff association members in the exercise.

For the Private Sector

4.6 It is more difficult to select precise job benchmarks for the private sector because the nature, scope and complexity of jobs differ from one company to another. Hay will, therefore, take a broader approach by seeking information on jobs from each company which will provide a complete picture of the total pay and fringe benefit levels of the companies. Hay have also produced a list of job families from which jobs will be selected for detailed examination. The list is at Appendix C to Hay's report at Annex C. Where such jobs do not exist within an organisation, other positions will be selected which represent the total range and complexity of functions within the company.

4.7 The number and range of positions selected in each organisation will be decided in consultation with the personnel manager of each company and will depend upon the size and complexity of the organisation. Altogether, it is envisaged that about 1,500 to 1,750 individual positions within the private sector will be studied.

4.8 Collection of job data in the private sector will be done by the use of questionnaires issued to job holders, interviews with the selected staff and consultations with personnel managers. The questionnaires used in the private sector will be the same as those used in the civil service. In addition, further information will be sought from organisation charts, published reports and other documentation.

4.9 Specific information will also be collected on starting pay and associated fringe benefits for jobs requiring particular qualifications.

Views Expressed at PLSAC Meetings

(a) Association of Expatriate Civil Servants

- (i) Has reservations regarding the process of reviewing evaluation results.
- (ii) Job evaluation points should be agreed in advance by the staff associations concerned.
- (iii) The following civil service jobs should be included for comparison with the private sector:

Estate Surveyor
Land Inspector.

(b) Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association

- (i) Consultation should take place among the Civil Service Branch, departmental management, heads of grades, staff groups and staff associations before the interviews.
- (ii) Briefing sessions should be provided for selected job holders and their immediate supervisors prior to interview to enable them to understand the importance of providing up-to-date and accurate information for Hay and of answering questions properly during interviews.
- (iii) Individual grade, staff association and group representatives should be present as observers during the interviews with job holders.
- (iv) One questionnaire should be used for all staff in order to avoid confusion and to maintain flexibility. The questionnaires should be presented in such a way that all staff, and, in particular, those in the middle and lower ranks, can understand them.
- (v) Sufficient time should be given to the job holders to fill in the questionnaires.

(iv) It should be possible to answer questionnaires in either English or Chinese.

(vii) The following civil service jobs should be included for pay comparisons with the private sector :

Works Supervisor II
Work Supervisor I
Tax Inspector II
Tax Inspector I
Nursing Officer I
Chief Nursing Officer
Transport Officer II
Transport Officer I
Senior Transport Officer.

(viii) Owing to the insufficient time and information allowed for studying the methodology, the Association and its various Branches and Affiliated Unions are not able to suggest the deletion or inclusion of any other ranks.

(c) Senior Non-Expatriate Officers' Association

(i) The following civil service jobs should be excluded from comparison with the private sector :

Senior Accounting Officer
Senior Waterworks Chemist
Senior Securities Officer
Chief Pharmacist
Cartographer.

(ii) The following civil service jobs should be included for comparison with the private sector :

Chief Management Services Officer
Principal Trade Officer
Senior Marine Officer
Senior Architect
Senior Assessor
Project Manager (Electronic Data Processing)
Senior Statistician.

(d) Model Scale 1 Staff Consultative Council

- (i) Has reservations about the low percentage of civil service jobs selected for comparison.
- (ii) Staff Side representatives should be involved in the process of reviewing evaluation results.
- (iii) There should be one questionnaire for all staff.
- (iv) The following civil service jobs should be excluded from comparison with the private sector :

Supplies Attendant
Laundry Worker.

(e) Hong Kong Institute of Personnel Management

A small sample in the region of 5% to 7% would be sufficient to provide statistically valid results.

(f) The Administration

Since in the civil service, expatriate and local civil servants are treated as one homogeneous group on matters concerning pay and because civil servants are paid on the basis of the jobs they perform, the survey of the pay component in the private sector should also take into account expatriate and local employees. In other respects, the Administration supports the methodology proposed by Hay.

Chapter 5

Job Evaluation

Consultants' Proposals

Job Factors

5.1 The method of job evaluation proposed by Hay does not involve job-matching or the identification of analogues, but entails an evaluation of common factors within each job. These factors are as follows :

- (a) KNOW-HOW : the total skills required to enable the job to be carried out properly;
- (b) PROBLEM-SOLVING : the original, "self-starting" thinking required by the job for analysing, evaluating, creating, reasoning, arriving at and making conclusions; and
- (c) ACCOUNTABILITY : the answerability for action and for the consequences thereof.

For any particular job, the importance of each of these three factors to the job will be assessed and a value assigned to it, using the Hay Guide Chart. The total number of points for each job can then be calculated by using the evaluation process.

Evaluation Committee

5.2 The evaluation process will be carried out by a committee of experienced consultants. The data for each job under consideration collected from the civil service and private sector companies will be presented by the consultant who conducted the interview with the job holder. The committee will discuss the data provided for each job and members will then prepare their evaluations independently of each other. The independent evaluations will be displayed and the results discussed until a consensus is reached, which will then be recorded. Staff of the Pay Survey and Research Unit will be present as observers at these evaluation meetings.

Correlation of Job Scores

5.3 The job scores thus obtained will then be correlated with job scores for similar industries and sectors held in the Hay database, in order to ensure that the same standard of evaluation has prevailed throughout the study. The consultant who led the evaluation committee for civil service jobs will present the evaluation results to a correlator experienced in public sector evaluations. The correlator will compare all the evaluations against a databank of evaluations for several thousand public sector positions and the consultant will be required to explain any apparent discrepancies in standards, until the correlator is satisfied that the same standard of evaluation has been maintained throughout. The process will then be repeated for private sector position evaluations. When the job scores for positions in both the civil service and the private sector are found to be satisfactory, data analysis can commence.

Views Expressed at PLSAC Meetings

(a) Senior Non-Expatriate Officers' Association

Findings concerning job sizes should be disclosed to PLSAC members. This suggestion is supported by the Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association.

(b) Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association

The use of the three common job factors in all cases is unfair to non-managerial staff. No account has been taken of factors such as hardship, danger, obnoxious working environments or unsocial working hours.

(c) Model Scale 1 Staff Consultative Council

(i) Representatives from staff associations should be present as observers at the job evaluation sessions in order to put forward their views before the evaluation results are finally submitted to the PLSAC. This suggestion is supported by the Association of Expatriate Civil Servants and the Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association.

(ii) There are doubts about the validity and accuracy of the evaluation results in view of the short time available. This view is also shared by the Hong Kong Chinese Civil Servants' Association.

(d) Employers' Federation of Hong Kong

The sample of civil service jobs may be too small when compared with that for the private sector. (The sample of civil service jobs has subsequently been increased to about 400).

(e) Hong Kong Institute of Personnel Management

It would be inappropriate for the job evaluation scores to be revealed to the PLSAC.

(f) Association of Expatriate Civil Servants

In the absence of equal representation, only Hay should decide on the points for each job and the evaluation process must be seen to be completely independent.

(g) The Administration

Supports the Hay methodology.