

21 October 1981.

His Excellency Sir Murray MacLehose, G.B.E., K.C.M.G., K.C.V.O.,
Governor of Hong Kong.

Your Excellency,

New Grades of Recreation and Sport Officer
and Music Officer

We have been asked to advise on appropriate pay scales and structures for two new grades, to be known as the Recreation and Sport Officer grade and the Music Officer grade, which Government proposes to create in the Recreation and Culture Division of the Home Affairs Branch. We have therefore conducted an examination of the duties and responsibilities which it is intended should be assigned to the new grades and we now submit our proposals for their pay and structure. These proposals are based on information provided by the Administration on the background to and objectives of the organisations to which the new grades are to belong.

Recreation and Sport Officer Grade

2. The Recreation and Sport Service was established in 1974 as a unit in the Education Department. Its main functions at that time were the overall planning, development, co-ordination and promotion of physical recreation and sports activities based on district needs. In addition, the Service was to be responsible for the management of facilities such as sports centres and holiday camps and for liaising with and providing assistance to athletic associations and sports clubs. With the creation of the Recreation and Culture Division in 1979, control of the Recreation and Sport Service was transferred to the new Division with its functions and responsibilities unchanged.

3. As part of the Education Department the Recreation and Sport Service was staffed by members of the Education grades and this arrangement has continued following transfer of the Service to the Recreation and Culture Division of the Home Affairs Branch. We understand, however, that the present arrangement is no longer considered to be satisfactory.

First, the staff seconded from the Education Department are not performing the normal duties of their counterparts in the Education grades and are understandably concerned about their future. Secondly, continuity of service cannot be maintained as staff are liable to transfer back to the Education Department. For these reasons, Government has proposed that a new departmental grade of Recreation and Sport Officer should be created, a proposal which we endorse.

4. Our examination has indicated that there are five distinct levels of responsibility below the directorate level for staff engaged in the promotion and organisation of recreation and sports activities. These levels of responsibility, in so far as they relate to the major activities of the grade, can be described in descending order as follows :

- Level 1 - In overall charge of all the regions and responsible for their smooth and efficient operation; co-ordinates regional efforts to provide a balanced recreation and sport service; liaises with national sports bodies and other agencies on the promotion of recreation and sports.
- Level 2 - Regional Officer. Manages and co-ordinates the work of a number of districts; decides on regional priorities; represents the Recreation and Sport Service on District Management Committees; maintains regular contact with recreation and sport organisations.
- Level 3 - District Officer. In charge of promoting and organising activities on a district basis; decides on district priorities; represents the Recreation and Sport Service on District Boards and Working Groups; advises on the planning, design and utilization of facilities and equipment in the district.
- Level 4 - Assistant District Officer. Deputises for the District Officer; represents the Recreation and Sport Service on Area Committees; identifies shortfalls and establishes the district's needs for recreation and sport services; plans, co-ordinates and evaluates the district programme; vets and approves programmes.
- Level 5 - Programme Officer. Organises, executes and evaluates recreation and sport programmes; supervises activities, and provides guidance to part-time instructors/organisers; assists in ascertaining district needs and in identifying shortfalls; represents the Recreation and Sport Service on Area Committees and Mutual Aid Committees.

It follows therefore, that within the framework of the Master Pay Scale, we propose that the new grade of Recreation and Sport Officer should have a five-rank structure.

5. To arrive at appropriate pay scales for the five ranks, we have first had regard to the basic qualification which will be required for appointment to the new grade. This, we are informed, will be a Teacher's Certificate with physical education as one of the subjects studied since this is the only full-time course which is directly relevant to the duties of the grade. The entry qualification can therefore be equated with that required for appointment to the Certificated Master grade. Moreover, we consider that the duties and the level of responsibility which will be exercised by the first rank of the Recreation and Sport Officer grade are comparable to those of teachers organising and running classes. On this basis, we propose that the first rank pay scale should be related to that of the Certificated Master rank.

6. Above the first rank, the work of the Certificated Master grade is no longer comparable to that performed by the Recreation and Sport Officer grade. The higher ranks in the new grade will be primarily involved in the planning and promoting of recreation and sports activities or in liaison at the district or regional level. In formulating our proposals for the pay scales of the Recreation and Sport Officer grade as a whole we have therefore had regard not only to the pay and structure of the Education grades but also to the pay and structure of grades the staff of which exercise corresponding levels of responsibility at a district or regional level, particularly in the case of the second, third and fourth ranks where the staff are members of district or regional teams. Our recommended pay scales are as follows :

<u>Proposed Rank</u>	<u>Proposed Pay Scale</u>
Chief Recreation & Sport Officer	MPS 48 - 51
Senior Recreation & Sport Officer	MPS 41 - 47
Recreation & Sport Officer	MPS 35 - 40
Assistant Recreation & Sport Officer I	MPS 25 - 34
Assistant Recreation & Sport Officer II	MPS 17 - 24

7. With regard to the position of staff at present serving on secondment to the Recreation and Sport Service, we would suggest that those considered suitable should be afforded the opportunity to transfer to the new grade in ranks appropriate to their existing duties and responsibilities.

Music Officer Grade

8. Like the Recreation and Sport Service the Music

Office, which was established in 1977, also began as part of the Education Department and was transferred to the Recreation and Culture Division on that Division's creation in 1979. The main functions of the Music Office were and are to run instrumental training schemes, to promote interest in music especially among the young and to encourage and assist in the organisation of music activities in districts. As part of its functions, the Music Office now manages and trains 13 youth orchestras and bands and runs instrumental, aural, theory and music appreciation training classes for some 2,000 students. In addition, it organises 'Music for the Millions' concerts and participates in international music exchange programmes.

9. Unlike their counterparts in the Recreation and Sport Service, the professional staff of the Music Office have hitherto been employed either on a temporary basis on fixed salaries or part-time on an hourly basis. This is because certain of the functions of the Music Office were initially introduced on an experimental basis. However the work of the Music Office has now progressed far beyond the experimental stage and Government proposes to create a permanent grade of Music Officer to perform the professional duties of the Music Office. Again we endorse this proposal since we believe the availability of a permanent career will assist with both the recruitment and retention of professional musicians.

10. In considering the structure of the Music Officer grade, we have noted the advice given by the Government Music Consultant regarding the need for different levels of music teaching staff. In the light of this advice and after considering the duties to be assigned to the Music Officer grade, we are satisfied that, as with the Recreation and Sport Officer grade, there will be five levels of responsibility. In this case the levels can be described as follows :

- Level 1 - In overall charge of the professional stream and head of the Music Officer grade.
- Level 2 - Head of each of the five disciplines : String, Wind, Chinese, Aural, Theory and Choral, and Music Promotion; responsible for planning and development and for overseeing the running of the respective disciplines.
- Level 3 - Deputy to the head of each discipline; undertakes internal inspections; assists in preparing teaching material and in selecting and disciplining students; conducts classes for outstanding students; organises large scale musical activities; assists in the formation, development and management of youth orchestras, bands and choral groups.
- Level 4 - Conducts classes for above average students; services and maintains discipline in main orchestras and bands; assists in organising music activities; participates in Music Office functions.

Level 5 - Conducts classes for beginners and average students; participates in Music Office functions, services and maintains discipline in district orchestras and bands; assists in organising music activities.

We therefore propose a five-rank structure for the new grade.

11. To determine appropriate pay scales for the Music Officer grade, we have again first had regard to the basic qualifications which will be required for entry to the grade. We understand that candidates will be required to be either a Licentiate of the Royal Schools of Music, a Licentiate of the Royal Academy of Music or an Associate of the Royal College of Music. In addition, candidates with acceptable equivalent qualifications and experience will be accepted for appointment to the Chinese Music discipline. We believe that these qualifications can be equated with those required for appointment to the Certificated Master grade and, since staff in the first two ranks of the grade will be primarily engaged in teaching duties, we propose that the pay scales of these ranks should be related to the ranks of Certificated Master and Assistant Master.

12. From the third rank upwards, the duties and responsibilities of staff will differ significantly from those of the Certificated Master grade; at this level, staff will be mainly engaged in planning, promoting and organising music activities and as performers. We therefore consider it more appropriate to relate the pay scales of the three higher ranks to the structure of middle management grades and our proposals for the grade as a whole are as follows :

<u>Proposed Rank</u>	<u>Proposed Pay Scale</u>
Chief Music Officer	MPS 48 - 51
Senior Music Officer	MPS 38 - 47
Music Officer	MPS 32 - 37
Assistant Music Officer I	MPS 25 - 31
Assistant Music Officer II	MPS 17 - 24

13. As we stated earlier the present professional staff of the Music Office are at present employed on temporary terms. Effectively they are free-lance staff and neither their present salaries nor ranking accords with the pay scales and structure proposed for the new Music Officer grade. While the methods of filling civil service posts are not strictly within our Terms of Reference, we would suggest that in this case consideration should be given to publicly advertising the posts in the new grade, particularly the most senior post, with applications from serving temporary staff considered on their merits alongside those of candidates responding to the advertisements.

General

14. The pay scales which we have proposed for the Recreation and Sport Officer and Music Officer grades have regard to the pay structures of more than one qualification group. To include the grades in any one qualification group would therefore be inappropriate. For this reason we recommend that they be included in that category of grades which we refer to as the "Other Grades" group.

15. If our proposals for the pay scales and structures of the Recreation and Sport Officer grade and the Music Officer grade are accepted, they should of course be implemented following the creation of the grades and the appointment of staff to the new ranks.

We have the honour to be
Your Excellency's obedient servants,

(S. Y. Chung)
Chairman

2 November 1981.

His Excellency Sir Murray MacLehose, G.B.E., K.C.M.G., K.C.V.O.,
Governor of Hong Kong.

Your Excellency,

The Caretaker and Watchman Grades

The Caretaker and Watchman grades are two of a number of Model Scale 1 grades identified in our Second Report on Civil Service Pay (Report No. 5) as requiring further review. In this case, we had noted that the work of the two grades appeared to be very similar and we asked that a survey of their duties and responsibilities be carried out to enable us to determine whether or not they should continue as separate grades. We have now received the results of the job survey which we had requested and have therefore conducted a further review of the grades concerned.

2. Caretakers and Watchmen are employed in 27 government departments. Caretaker is a one-rank grade with an establishment of 85 posts and Watchman is a two-rank grade with an establishment of 968 posts. The present pay scales of the two grades are as follows :

<u>Caretaker Grade</u>	<u>Pay Scale</u>
Caretaker	MOD 1 - 4
<u>Watchman Grade</u>	
Watchman	MOD 5 - 10
Head Watchman	MOD 11 - 15

3. According to the job survey, in general Watchmen patrol designated areas or stand guard at specified points to protect property and keep trespassers out whilst Caretakers are responsible for the security and cleanliness of designated areas. Staff of both grades may be engaged in preventing the entry of unauthorised persons and cars, dealing with problems arising from trespasses, nuisances or emergencies, ensuring the proper functioning of buildings' utilities, performing minor repairs and supervising cleansing work. The survey has thus confirmed our

view that there is no significant difference between the duties of Watchmen and Caretakers; indeed it has shown that in some departments Caretakers perform duties identical to those of Watchmen in other departments. In the first place, therefore, we recommend that the existing two grades be replaced by a single grade.

4. As to which of the two existing grades should form the single grade, we note that there is a degree of responsibility in the work of both Caretakers and Watchmen. As mentioned in the preceding paragraph, staff in either grade may be required to take action to deal with problems arising from trespasses, nuisances or emergencies and this requires initiative especially when they occur outside normal working hours. There is also a degree of confrontation involved in the performance of their duties and the nature of their job is such that it invariably involves working irregular hours. Having regard to these factors we consider that of the pay scales at present attaching to the Caretaker and Watchman ranks, the higher pay scale of the latter, MOD 5 - 10, is appropriate. It follows that we recommend that the single grade should be the Watchman grade and that Caretaker posts should be replaced by Watchman posts.

5. Although in general we consider that Caretakers should be regraded as Watchmen, this may not be appropriate in every case. Regrading should therefore be determined on an individual basis having regard to the duties and responsibilities of each post.

6. Besides commenting on the similarity between the work of the Caretaker and Watchman grades, in Report No. 5 we also questioned the need for the Head Watchman rank. However, the job survey of the Watchman grade has shown that Head Watchmen have a functional role in large compounds, for example hospitals, where they supervise and organise the work of a number of Watchmen. In the circumstances, we are satisfied that the Head Watchman rank should be retained and propose that its pay scale should be adjusted to MOD 11 - 17 in line with the pay scales of ranks on Model Scale 1 exercising comparable levels of responsibility. The pay scales of the Watchman grade would then be as follows :

<u>Watchman Grade</u>	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>
Watchman	MOD 5 - 10	MOD 5 - 10
Head Watchman	MOD 11 - 15	MOD 11 - 17

7. Since the Watchman grade is a grade outstanding from our earlier reviews, our proposed adjustment to the pay scale of the Head Watchman rank, if accepted, should be implemented with effect from 1 October 1979, i.e. the date of implementation of the recommendations for individual Model Scale 1 grades dealt with in our Report No. 5. In the case of Caretakers, those accepted for regrading as Watchmen should receive the new pay scale from the date of such regrading.

8. Our examination of the Caretaker and Watchman grades has brought to light a curious situation with regard to the grade titles in Chinese. Although Watchmen (看更) receive higher pay than Caretakers (管理員), the Chinese titles of the grades imply that Caretakers undertake a wider scope of responsibility, which is the case in the private sector but not in government. We would suggest therefore, that if our proposal to amalgamate the Caretaker and Watchman grades is accepted, the opportunity should be taken to devise a title for the combined grade in both Chinese and English which adequately reflects its duties and responsibilities.

9. The proposals in respect of the Caretaker and Watchman grades complete our reviews of Model Scale 1 grades outstanding from Report No. 5. We therefore do not envisage recommending the backdating of any further adjustments to pay scales of grades on Model Scale 1.

We have the honour to be,
Your Excellency's obedient servants,

(S.Y. Chung)
Chairman