

28 January 1981.

His Excellency Sir Murray MacLehose, G.B.E., K.C.M.G., K.C.V.O.,
Governor of Hong Kong.

Your Excellency,

Certain Supervisory Grades on the Master Pay
Scale and on Model Scale 1

In our First Report on Civil Service Pay (Report No. 2) we commented that there appeared to be an excessive number of supervisory ranks on Model Scale 1. In our Second Report on Civil Service Pay (Report No. 5) we made recommendations on some of these ranks but deferred the consideration of others in order that they could be examined alongside the grades on the Master Pay Scale by which they are supervised.

In Report No. 2 we had also undertaken to conduct a further review of the Works Supervisor grade. This review was completed in November 1980 and we tendered our advice on the grade to Your Excellency in a letter dated 12 November 1980. Since our proposals for the Works Supervisor grade were based on factors such as recruitment and retention difficulties and job content, which might apply to other comparable grades, we considered it necessary to extend the review referred to in paragraph 1 above to include those supervisory grades which are related to Works Supervisor.

We have now completed our further review of the grades concerned and our findings are contained in the Annex to this letter.

We have the honour to be,
Your Excellency's obedient servants,

(S. Y. Chung)
Chairman

ANNEX

REVIEW OF CERTAIN SUPERVISORY GRADES ON THE
MASTER PAY SCALE AND ON MODEL SCALE 1

In our Second Report on Civil Service Pay (Report No. 5) and our letter dated 12 November 1980 conveying our advice on the pay and structure of the Works Supervisor grade, we undertook to conduct a further review of a number of supervisory grades on the Master Pay Scale and on Model Scale 1. We have now completed this review.

2. To assist in our review, we sought information from the Administration on the duties and responsibilities of grades in two categories :

- (a) Grades in Group II of the Technical Inspectorate and related grades on the Master Pay Scale
- (b) Supervisory grades on Model Scale 1 identified in Report No. 5 as requiring further study.

In December 1980 we received the information we had requested and have examined this together with any representations received from staff and management in respect of the grades concerned. The results of this examination are set out in paragraphs 4 to 31.

3. The number of posts shown against each grade title is taken from the approved "Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure for the year ending 31 March 1981" brought up to date where more recent information is available.

Technical Inspectorate and Related Grades
(Group II)

4. Although we have considered all the grades in this group, except those which have been the subject of recent advice either in Report No. 5 or in separate letters to His Excellency the Governor, we refer only to those grades in respect of which we recommend changes in the pay scales or structure. There is one exception : for reasons which we give later we consider that the House Service Inspector grade requires further examination. In the case of other grades in the Group we have found no grounds at present for modifying the proposals contained in our First Report on Civil Service Pay (Report No. 2).

5. Because of the consequential nature of some of our recommendations our comments on the grades reviewed appear in the following order :

- (a) Grades which our examination has shown are directly comparable with the Works Supervisor grade as regards both type of duties and levels of responsibility.
- (b) The Foreman grade which has a historical relationship with the Works Supervisor grade.
- (c) Grades the pay scales of which we consider should have regard to those of the Foreman grade.

For easy reference, a summary of our recommendations listing the grades in alphabetical order is in paragraph 32.

6. Diver's Linesmen are employed in the Public Works Department and are responsible to an Assistant Inspector of Works, mainly for the preparation and conduct of diving operations. They supervise a crew of Artisans and Marine staff. Appointment to the rank requires many years' experience at the Artisan level and a sound knowledge of mechanics and drawing in addition to the ability to operate and maintain diving equipment. We consider the experience required for appointment and the duties and levels of responsibility of Diver's Linesmen to be similar to those of Works Supervisors I. We therefore recommend that the Diver's Linesman grade should be merged with the Works Supervisor I rank of the Works Supervisor grade.

ExistingProposed

Diver's Linesman MPS 14 - 17 Works Supervisor I MPS 16 - 19

Shipping Safety Assistant

15 posts

7. Shipping Safety Assistants are employed in the Marine Department where they assist Shipping Safety Officers in the inspection of vessels to ensure that safe working conditions are maintained during the construction and repair of ships or during cargo handling. Appointment to the grade normally requires completion of an approved apprenticeship following a minimum of Form III education together with five years' post-apprenticeship experience. There is a persistent recruitment problem with this grade.

8. We consider that the duties and level of responsibility of Shipping Safety Assistants are comparable

to those of Works Supervisor I and we therefore propose that the pay scale be equated with that of the latter rank.

	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>
Shipping Safety Assistant	MPS 14 - 17	MPS 16 - 19
<u>Vehicle Tester</u>		30 posts

9. Vehicle Testers are employed in the Transport Department on testing road worthiness and checking for defects in motor vehicles. The appointment requirements are similar to one of those for Works Supervisor II; that is to say considerable experience at the Artisan level after completion of an approved apprenticeship.

10. We consider that the duties of Vehicle Testers are comparable to those of Works Supervisors II in the vehicle workshop of the Electrical and Mechanical Office of the Public Works Department. We therefore propose that their pay scale should be aligned with that of Works Supervisor II except that Vehicle Testers should retain their one-point lead at the minimum in view of the requirement to possess a valid driving licence for goods vehicles.

	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>
Vehicle Tester	MPS 12 - 14	MPS 12 - 15
<u>House Service Inspector</u>		90 posts

11. House Service Inspectors are responsible to

Assistant Waterworks Inspectors for the inspection of the work of licensed plumbers to ensure compliance with the Waterworks Ordinance and Regulations. These duties appear to be comparable to those of Works Supervisors employed in the inspection of contractor's work. Moreover, the minimum qualification for entry to the grade, a Hong Kong Polytechnic Certificate, is one of the qualifications for entry to the Works Supervisor grade. However the pay scale of House Service Inspectors (MPS 13 - 19) spans the pay scales of Works Supervisor II and I and the entry point is two points higher than that of Works Supervisor II. On the information at present available we have been unable to determine whether this scale is justified. We therefore consider that a further detailed study of the duties and responsibilities of the grade should be carried out. This should include an examination of the possibility of merging the grade with appropriate ranks of the Works Supervisor grade.

12. We would add that both staff and departmental management have represented that the pay scale of House Service Inspectors should be improved : the former on the basis of a comparison with grades in other qualification groups and the latter on the grounds of the technical knowledge required and level of responsibility exercised. Since we consider the House Service Inspector grade requires further study, we make no judgement on these claims, but would state that on the information available to us at present the duties and responsibilities of the grade appear to be comparable with those of Works Supervisors rather than with those of other grades.

13. Foremen are employed in several departments but the great majority, over 90%, work in the Urban Services Department. They are primarily engaged in the supervision of, and assignment of work to, teams of minor staff or on law enforcement duties.
14. As we have mentioned in paragraph 5, Foremen have a historical connection with Works Supervisors. Until 1977, the duties of Works Supervisors were performed by staff in the Foreman grade. However, the 1977 Technical Grades Review found that the work of Foremen and Senior Foremen in the Public Works Department was of a more technical nature, and therefore they were regraded as Works Supervisors II and I respectively to better reflect their duties. Subsequently, this regrading was extended to Foreman posts in other departments where the work had a more technical content. Despite the regrading, the pay scales for the ranks of Works Supervisor II and I and for Foreman and Senior Foreman remained the same.
15. Our proposals to improve the pay scales of the Works Supervisor grade, which have been accepted by Government, have necessitated a further examination of the Foreman grade to see whether the difference in pay which our proposals for the Works Supervisor grade have introduced is fully justified. As a result of our examination, we have concluded that the duties and responsibilities of Works Supervisor, particularly their more technical nature, are such that higher pay scales than those applicable to the corresponding ranks in the Foreman grade are warranted.

Nevertheless we consider that some adjustment to the pay scales of the Foreman grade is also required.

16. In the first place, we consider that the entry point should be lowered to bring it into line with other comparable grades within this group. Posts in the Foreman rank are normally filled by the advancement of staff on Model Scale 1, mainly Gangers or Workmen I, or from junior ranks on the Master Pay Scale where staff have shown supervisory ability. The pay scale of the Model Scale 1 ranks which provide the major source of Foremen is MOD 5 - 10, i.e. roughly equivalent to MPS 6 - 8. We therefore consider that the minimum of the Foreman rank should be MPS 9. We have noted that there is also provision for direct entry to the grade for a number of school certificate holders. For such recruits without previous experience we consider an entry point of MPS 7 to be appropriate.

17. At the same time, having regard to the job content of the grade, particularly the level of supervisory responsibilities exercised or involvement in law enforcement duties, we consider that the maximum of the Foreman scale should be raised by one point with consequential adjustments to the pay scales of the Senior Foreman and Overseer ranks. We therefore recommend that the pay scales of the Foreman grade should be revised as follows :

	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>
Foreman	MPS 11 - 13	MPS 9 - 14
Senior Foreman	MPS 14 - 17	MPS 15 - 18
Overseer	MPS 18 - 24	MPS 19 - 24
Senior Overseer	MPS 25 - 29	MPS 25 - 29

18. In our Report No. 2, we referred to a representation from the staff of the Foreman grade in the Urban Services Department asking that their posts be departmentalised and commented that this request should be considered by Government and the Urban Council. We have recently seen the results of an examination of this question which show that no benefit would accrue to either staff or management from the departmentalisation of the Foreman grade in the Urban Services Department. In so far as pay is concerned, we would point out that with over 90% of the Foreman grade employed in the Urban Services Department, it is clearly the duties and responsibilities of Foremen in that department which are the major factors in determining pay levels.

Field Assistant

322 posts

19. Field Assistants are employed in the Agriculture and Fisheries Department where they perform supervisory field duties or duties of a minor technical or law enforcement nature in connection with the handling of livestock, crops, forestry operations, country park management and so on. We consider these duties and responsibilities to be comparable with those of the Foreman grade and propose that the pay scales of the grade be adjusted accordingly.